

o.c. 3670  
ref. 306267



# AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

Vol. 111

April 2017

No. 2

CONTENTS

PAGE

## The Judicial Trilemma

*Jeffrey L. Dunoff and Mark A. Pollack*

225

International tribunals confront a "Judicial Trilemma." More specifically the states that design, and the judges that serve on, international courts face an interlocking series of tradeoffs among three core values: (1) judicial independence, the freedom of judges to decide cases on the facts and the law; (2) judicial accountability, structural checks on judicial authority found most prominently in international courts in reappointment and reelection processes; and (3) judicial transparency, mechanisms that permit the identification of individual judicial positions (such as through individual opinions and dissents). The Trilemma is that it is possible to maximize, at most, two of these three values. Drawing on interviews with current and former judges at leading international courts, this article unpacks the logic underlying the Judicial Trilemma, and traces the varied ways in which this logic manifests itself in the design and operation of the International Court of Justice, European Court of Human Rights, Court of Justice of the European Union, and the World Trade Organization's Appellate Body. The Judicial Trilemma does not identify an "ideal" court design. Rather it provides a framework that enables international actors to understand the inevitable tradeoffs that international courts confront, and thereby helps to ensure that these tradeoffs are made deliberately and with a richer appreciation of their implications.

## Human Rights Experimentalism

*Gráinne de Búrca*

277

Human rights in general and the international human rights system in particular have come under increasing attack in recent years. Quite apart from the domestic and global political events since 2016, including an apparent retreat from international institutions, the human rights system has in recent times come in for severe criticism from academic scholars. Amongst the various criticisms levelled have been: (1) the ineffectiveness and lack of impact of international human rights regimes, (2) the ambiguity and lack of specificity of human rights standards, (3) the weakness of international human rights enforcement mechanisms, and (4) the claim to universalism of human rights standards coupled with the hegemonic imposition of these standards on diverse parts of the world. This article responds to several of those criticisms by introducing the idea of experimentalist governance, interpreting key

	<i>Garcia De Borissaw and Others v. Supreme Court of Justice</i> (Santiago Diaz-Cediel)	446
	Columbian Constitutional Court decisions on customary international law immunity of foreign diplomatic missions from execution of judgments arising from violations of domestic labor regulations	
	<i>Commisimpex v. Republic of Congo</i> (Eloïse Glucksmann)	453
	French Court of Cassation decision on validity under customary international law of express waivers of sovereign immunity from execution against state property and related legislation	
317	<i>Anchugov &amp; Gladkov v. Russia</i> (A.Kh. Abashidze, M.V. Ilyashevich and A.M. Solntsev)	461
	Russian Constitutional Court decision on obligation of Russian courts to enforce judgments of European Court of Human Rights that conflict with fundamental principles of the Russian Constitution	
	<i>On the Interpretation of Article E(2) of the Fundamental Law</i> (Ágoston Mohay and Norbert Tóth)	468
	Hungarian Constitutional Court on whether Hungary's obligations to the European Union violate fundamental rights or national sovereignty as protected by the Hungarian Constitution	

#### **Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law**

*Edited by Kristina Daugirdas and Julian Davis Mortenson*

	United States Abstains on Security Council Resolution Criticizing Israeli Settlements	477
357	United States Sanctions Russian Individuals and Entities After Accusing Russian Government of Using Hacking to Interfere with U.S. Election Process; Congressional Committees and Intelligence and Law Enforcement Agencies Continue to Investigate President Trump's Connections to Russian Officials	483
376	Second Circuit Overturns \$655 Million Jury Verdict Against Palestine Liberation Organization and Palestinian Authority	504
395	New Legislation Seeks to Confirm Immunity of Artwork and Facilitate Cultural Exchange	510
415	United States Confronts China over Seizure of Unmanned Drone in the South China Sea	513
437	International Criminal Court Prosecutor Recommends Investigation of Potential War Crimes in Afghanistan, Including Actions by U.S. Military and Central Intelligence Agency	517
439	United States Strikes Houthi-Controlled Facilities in Yemen, Reaffirms Limited Support for Saudi-Led Coalition Notwithstanding Growing Concerns About Civilian Casualties	523
	United States Expands Military Operations in North Africa and Classifies al-Shabaab as a Force "Associated" with Al Qaeda	533